

## STA 431s13 Assignment Five<sup>1</sup>

All these questions are just practice for the quiz on Feb. 15th, and are not to be handed in. The first question is a deliberate repeat from last week. If you did it already, that's great.

1. Here is a multivariate regression model with no intercept and no measurement error. Independently for  $i = 1, \dots, n$ ,

$$\mathbf{Y}_i = \boldsymbol{\beta}\mathbf{X}_i + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$$

where

$\mathbf{Y}_i$  is an  $q \times 1$  random vector of observable response variables, so the regression can be multivariate; there are  $q$  response variables.

$\mathbf{X}_i$  is a  $p \times 1$  multivariate normal observable random vector; there are  $p$  explanatory variables.  $\mathbf{X}_i$  has expected value zero and variance-covariance matrix  $\boldsymbol{\Phi}$ , a  $p \times p$  symmetric and positive definite matrix of unknown constants.

$\boldsymbol{\beta}$  is a  $q \times p$  matrix of unknown constants. These are the regression coefficients, with one row for each response variable and one column for each explanatory variable.

$\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$  is the error term of the latent regression. It is an  $q \times 1$  multivariate normal random vector with expected value zero and variance-covariance matrix  $\boldsymbol{\Psi}$ , a  $q \times q$  symmetric and positive definite matrix of unknown constants.  $\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$  is independent of  $\mathbf{X}_i$ .

- (a) Calculate the variance-covariance matrix of the observable variables. It's a partitioned matrix. Show your work.
- (b) Write down the moment structure equations. These are matrix equations.
- (c) Does this problem pass the test of the Parameter Count Rule? Answer Yes or No and give the numbers.
- (d) Are the parameters of this model identifiable? Answer Yes or No and prove your answer. If the answer is no, all you need is a simple numerical example of two different parameter vectors that yield the same probability distribution for the sample data.

---

<sup>1</sup>Copyright information is at the end of the last page.

2. Independently for  $i = 1, \dots, n$ , let

$$\begin{aligned} Y_i &= \beta X_i + \epsilon_i \\ W_{i,1} &= X_i + e_{i,1} \\ W_{i,2} &= X_i + e_{i,2} \\ V_i &= Y_i + e_{i,3}, \end{aligned}$$

where

- $X_i$  and  $Y_i$  are latent variables, while  $W_{i,1}$ ,  $W_{i,2}$  and  $V_i$  are observable.
  - $X_i$  is a normally distributed *latent* variable with mean zero and variance  $\phi > 0$
  - $\epsilon_i$  is normally distributed with mean zero and variance  $\psi > 0$
  - $e_{i,1}$  is normally distributed with mean zero and variance  $\omega_1 > 0$
  - $e_{i,2}$  is normally distributed with mean zero and variance  $\omega_2 > 0$
  - $e_{i,3}$  is normally distributed with mean zero and variance  $\omega_3 > 0$
  - $X_i$ ,  $\epsilon_i$ ,  $e_{i,1}$ ,  $e_{i,2}$  and  $e_{i,3}$  are all independent of one another.
- (a) What is the parameter vector  $\theta$  for this model?
  - (b) Does this problem pass the test of the Parameter Count Rule? Answer Yes or No and give the numbers.
  - (c) Calculate the variance-covariance matrix of the observable variables. Show your work.
  - (d) Is the parameter  $\beta$  identifiable? Answer Yes and prove it.
  - (e) Give a simple numerical example to show that the entire parameter vector is not identifiable.
  - (f) This model places one equality constraint on the covariance matrix. What is it?
  - (g) What null hypothesis could you test about the covariances  $\sigma_{ij}$  to challenge the model? What would you conclude if  $H_0$  were rejected? Hint: the null hypothesis contains an = sign.
  - (h) You can also use the model to deduce more than one testable *inequality* involving the variances and covariances. Give at least two.

3. Let

$$\begin{aligned}W_i &= X_i + e_i \\Y_{i,1} &= \beta_1 X_i + \epsilon_{i,1} \\Y_{i,2} &= \beta_2 X_i + \epsilon_{i,2}\end{aligned}$$

where  $X_i$ ,  $e_i$ ,  $\epsilon_{i,1}$  and  $\epsilon_{i,2}$  are all independent,  $Var(X_i) = \phi$ ,  $Var(e_i) = \omega$ ,  $Var(\epsilon_{i,1}) = \psi_1$ ,  $Var(\epsilon_{i,2}) = \psi_2$ , and all the expected values are zero. The explanatory variable  $X_i$  is latent, while  $W_i$ ,  $Y_{i,1}$  and  $Y_{i,2}$  are observable

- (a) What is the parameter vector  $\theta$  for this model?
- (b) Does this problem pass the test of the Parameter Count Rule? Answer Yes or No and give the numbers.
- (c) Calculate the variance-covariance matrix of the observable variables. Show your work.
- (d) The parameter of primary interest is  $\beta_1$ . Is  $\beta_1$  identifiable at points in the parameter space where  $\beta_1 = 0$ ? Why or why not?
- (e) Give a simple numerical example to show that  $\beta_1$  is not identifiable at points in the parameter space where  $\beta_1 \neq 0$  and  $\beta_2 = 0$ .
- (f) Is  $\beta_1$  identifiable at points in the parameter space where  $\beta_2 \neq 0$ ? Answer Yes or No and prove your answer.
- (g) Show that the entire parameter vector is identifiable at points in the parameter space where  $\beta_1 \neq 0$  and  $\beta_2 \neq 0$ .
- (h) It is reasonable to assume  $\beta_2 \neq 0$ , since  $Y_2$  is an instrumental variable and we assume it's well chosen. So at points in the parameter space where  $\beta_2 \neq 0$ , what *two* equality constraints on the elements of  $\Sigma$  are implied by  $H_0 : \beta_1 = 0$ ?
- (i) Assuming  $\beta_1 \neq 0$  and  $\beta_2 \neq 0$ , you can use the model to deduce more than one testable *inequality* involving the variances and covariances. Give at least one example.

4. This example shows that sometimes, another explanatory variable can be as useful as an instrumental variable. Independently for  $i = 1, \dots, n$ , let

$$\begin{aligned} W_{i,1} &= \nu_1 + X_{i,1} + e_{i,1} \\ Y_{i,1} &= \alpha_1 + \beta_1 X_{i,1} + \epsilon_{i,1} \\ W_{i,2} &= \nu_2 + X_{i,2} + e_{i,2} \\ Y_{i,2} &= \alpha_2 + \beta_2 X_{i,2} + \epsilon_{i,2}, \end{aligned}$$

where  $E(X_{i,j}) = \mu_j$ ,  $e_{i,j}$  and  $\epsilon_{i,j}$  are independent of one another and of  $X_{i,j}$ ,  $Var(e_{i,j}) = \omega_j$ ,  $Var(\epsilon_{i,j}) = \psi_j$ , and

$$V \begin{pmatrix} X_{i,1} \\ X_{i,1} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \phi_{11} & \phi_{12} \\ \phi_{12} & \phi_{22} \end{pmatrix}.$$

- Calculate the variance-covariance matrix of the observable variables. Show your work.
- Show that  $\beta_1$  and  $\beta_2$  are identifiable provided  $\phi_{12} \neq 0$ .
- Are there any other points in the parameter space where  $\beta_1$  is identifiable?  $\beta_2$ ?
- Give one testable equality constraint (a statement about the  $\sigma_{ij}$  quantities) that is implied by the model. Is it still true with  $\phi_{12} = 0$ ?  $\beta_1 = 0$ ?  $\beta_2 = 0$ ?
- Suppose you wanted to estimate  $\beta_1$ . Suggest a *statistic* (function of the sample data) to serve as an estimator.
- Is your estimator consistent? Under what circumstances? You don't have to prove anything in detail.
- If the primary interest is in  $\beta_1$ , do we really need the response variable  $Y_{i,2}$ ?

5. In this problem,  $Y_{i,1}$  is the dependent variable of primary interest, while  $Y_{i,2}$  and  $Y_{i,3}$  are instrumental variables. The point of the question is that the error terms of instrumental variables need not all be independent.

Independently for  $i = 1, \dots, n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} Y_{i,1} &= \beta_{0,1} + \beta_{1,1}X_i + \epsilon_{i,1} \\ Y_{i,2} &= \beta_{0,2} + \beta_{1,2}X_i + \epsilon_{i,2} \\ Y_{i,3} &= \beta_{0,3} + \beta_{1,3}X_i + \epsilon_{i,3} \\ W_i &= X_i + e_i \end{aligned}$$

where

- $X_i \sim N(\mu_x, \phi)$  is a latent variable
- $e_i \sim N(0, \omega)$
- $\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i = (\epsilon_{i,1}, \epsilon_{i,2}, \epsilon_{i,3})'$
- $X_i$ ,  $e_i$  and  $\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$  are independent of one another
- $\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$  is multivariate normal with mean zero and covariance matrix

$$\boldsymbol{\Psi} = \begin{bmatrix} \psi_{1,1} & \psi_{1,2} & 0 \\ \psi_{1,2} & \psi_{2,2} & \psi_{2,3} \\ 0 & \psi_{2,3} & \psi_{3,3} \end{bmatrix}.$$

- (a) What is the parameter vector  $\boldsymbol{\theta}$  for this model?
- (b) How many moment structure equations are there. You do not have to say what they are; just give a number. Don't forget the means.
- (c) Does this problem pass the test of the Counting Rule? Answer Yes or No.
- (d) Calculate the variance-covariance matrix of the observable variables. Remember that some covariances between errors are non-zero. Show your work.
- (e) Solving the complete set of moment structure equations can be done<sup>2</sup> but it's a big chore. The primary interest is in the parameter  $\beta_{1,1}$ . Show that just this parameter is identifiable.

---

This assignment was prepared by [Jerry Brunner](#), Department of Statistical Sciences, University of Toronto. It is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution - ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License](#). Use any part of it as you like and share the result freely. The L<sup>A</sup>T<sub>E</sub>X source code may be found at In Appendix A and at the end of Chapter 0 in the textbook:

<http://www.utstat.toronto.edu/~brunner/openSEM>

---

<sup>2</sup>Even the intercepts are identifiable from the mean vector  $\boldsymbol{\mu}$ , because there is no measurement bias term in this model. That's unrealistic, of course.